# 1 The potential for mobile demersal fishing to reduce carbon

# <sup>2</sup> storage and sequestration in seabed sediments

3 Graham Epstein<sup>1</sup>\*, Julie P. Hawkins<sup>1</sup>, Catrin R. Norris<sup>1</sup>, Callum M. Roberts<sup>1</sup>

<sup>4</sup> <sup>1</sup>University of Exeter, Centre for Ecology and Conservation, Penryn Campus, Cornwall, TR10 9FE.

5 \*Corresponding author: Email: g.epstein@exeter.ac.uk

6

7 G. Epstein – ORCiD 0000-0002-9881-4779; J. P. Hawkins - ORCiD 0000-0002-0794-9257;

8 C. M. Roberts - ORCiD 0000-0003-2276-4258

9

#### 10 Abstract

11 Subtidal marine sediments are one of the planet's primary carbon stores and strongly influence the oceanic sink for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. By far the most pervasive human activity occurring on 12 13 the seabed is bottom trawling and dredging for fish and shellfish. A global first-order estimate suggested mobile demersal fishing activities may cause 160-400 Mt of organic carbon (OC) 14 15 to be remineralised annually from seabed sediment carbon stores. There are, however, many 16 uncertainties in this calculation. Here, we discuss the potential drivers of change in seabed 17 OC stores due to mobile demersal fishing activities and conduct a systematic review, synthesising studies where this interaction has been directly investigated. Mobile demersal 18 19 fishing would be expected to reduce OC in seabed stores, albeit with site-specific variability. Reductions would occur due to lower production of flora and fauna, the loss of fine flocculent 20 material, increased sediment resuspension, mixing and transport, and increased oxygen 21 22 exposure. This would be offset to some extent by reduced faunal bioturbation and respiration, 23 increased off-shelf transport and increases in primary production from the resuspension of nutrients. Studies which directly investigated the impact of demersal fishing on OC stocks had 24 mixed results. A finding of no significant effect was reported in 51% of 59 experimental 25 contrasts; 41% reported lower OC due to fishing activities, with 8% reporting higher OC. In 26 relation to remineralisation rates within the seabed, 14 experimental contrasts reported that 27 demersal fishing activities decreased remineralisation, with four reporting higher 28 remineralisation rates. The direction of effects was related to sediment type, impact duration, 29 study design and local hydrography. More evidence is urgently needed to accurately quantify 30 the impact of anthropogenic physical disturbance on seabed carbon in different environmental 31 32 settings, and incorporate full evidence-based carbon considerations into global seabed management. 33

#### 35 **1. Introduction**

36

Through a mixture of physical, chemical and biological processes, the ocean has absorbed 37 ~40% of anthropogenic  $CO_2$  emissions since the industrial revolution (Gruber et al. 2019, 38 Watson et al. 2020). The term "blue carbon" describes the ability of marine ecosystems to 39 40 absorb  $CO_2$  from the atmosphere or water column, assimilate this inorganic carbon (IC) into organic compounds and isolate it from remineralisation for centennial to millennial time-scales 41 (Nellemann et al. 2009). This process of carbon capture is key to maintaining the ecological 42 43 functioning of the ocean (Bauer et al. 2013) and is beneficial as a sink for anthropogenic  $CO_2$ (Khatiwala et al. 2009, Gruber et al. 2019). 44

45

46 Research on blue carbon initially focused on the coastal vegetated habitats of mangroves, 47 seagrass and saltmarsh, due to their ability to fix CO<sub>2</sub> directly, store high concentrations of organic carbon (OC) in-situ within underlying sediments and to accrete this OC indefinitely 48 over time (McLeod et al. 2011, Duarte et al. 2013). Although these habitats are some of the 49 most intense OC sinks on the planet (Duarte et al. 2013), with sequestration rates considerably 50 higher than forests on land (McLeod et al. 2011), their limited spatial scale of approximately 1 51 52 million km<sup>2</sup> or ~0.2% of the ocean's surface, means they only contain a small proportion of the ocean's total OC stock (Nellemann et al. 2009, Duarte et al. 2013, Duarte 2017, Howard et al. 53 54 2017, Atwood et al. 2020).

55

By far the largest mass of OC occurs in the pelagic zone (Nellemann et al. 2009), with much 56 of this in flux between the oceanic IC pool and the atmosphere (Bauer et al. 2013). However, 57 at depths below 1000 m, pelagic OC may become isolated from atmospheric exchange 58 59 processes for centennial time scales (Caldeira et al. 2002, Nellemann et al. 2009, Krause-Jensen and Duarte 2016). How this should be accounted for remains a matter of debate, and 60 61 so pelagic OC is rarely used in the quantification or classification of blue carbon (Lovelock and Duarte 2019). That withstanding, subtidal marine sediments contain the ocean's biggest OC 62 store, estimated to hold ~87 Gt of OC in the upper 5 cm (Lee et al. 2019) or ~2.3 Tt in the top 63 1 m (Duarte et al. 2013, Atwood et al. 2020). Quantification of annual sequestration rates in 64 65 these sediments is relatively poorly constrained, however they have been estimated globally at approximately 126 - 350 Mt OC yr<sup>-1</sup> (Berner 1982, Seiter et al. 2004, Burdige 2007, Keil 66 2017, Lee et al. 2019, Smeaton et al. 2021). 67

68

69 Seabed sediments are subjected to a wide range of direct physical impacts from human 70 pressures, namely: shipping, mineral extraction, fishing, energy developments, deployment of 71 cables and pipelines, coastal development, dredging of shipping access channels and

disposal of dredge spoil (Halpern et al. 2019, O'Hara et al. 2021). By far the most widespread 72 73 source of disturbance is bottom trawling and dredging for fish and shellfish (Oberle et al. 2016a, Amoroso et al. 2018, Kroodsma et al. 2018, O'Hara et al. 2021). These pressures are 74 pervasive and long lasting, with improved technologies over the last two centuries increasing 75 the spread of mobile fishing gears to deeper waters and much of the global ocean (Roberts 76 2007, Watson and Morato 2013, Kroodsma et al. 2018). Compared to many other types of 77 stressors, in intensively fished areas, trawling and dredging can also occur on the same area 78 of seabed numerous times in a year (Tillin et al. 2006, Hinz et al. 2009, Oberle et al. 2016a). 79 80

Globally, fishing pressure with mobile demersal gear is concentrated in subtidal areas at depths above 1000 m in coastal habitats and offshore on continental shelves and slopes (Amoroso et al. 2018, Kroodsma et al. 2018). In total these areas cover around 9% of the global seabed, yet they store an estimated 360 Gt in their top 1 m of sediment (Atwood et al. 2020). Continental shelf sediments are also highly productive, estimated to sequester up to 86% of all OC that is buried annually in global subtidal sediments (Berner 1982, Seiter et al. 2004, Atwood et al. 2020, Smeaton et al. 2021).

88

89 Mobile demersal fishing activity significantly alters seabed faunal communities (Kaiser et al. 90 2006, Sciberras et al. 2016, Hiddink et al. 2017), restructures the top layers of benthic 91 sediments (Trimmer et al. 2005, Puig et al. 2012, Eigaard et al. 2016, Oberle et al. 2016b) and 92 resuspends large volumes of sediment into the water column (Jones 1992, Ruffin 1998, Thrush and Dayton 2002, Durrieu de Madron et al. 2005, Martín et al. 2014b, Palanques et al. 93 2014). However, the net effect of this disturbance on OC stores is poorly resolved. Through 94 mixing, resuspension and oxidation of surface sediments, along with the disturbance of 95 96 benthic communities, fishing likely generates a source of "underwater carbon emissions" via increased remineralisation of OC, and will also limit future OC sequestration by inhibiting long-97 term sediment settlement and consolidation (Martín et al. 2014b, Keil 2017, Luisetti et al. 2019, 98 De Borger et al. 2021, Sala et al. 2021). This disturbance can be expected to increase IC 99 concentrations in the ocean, and via this, slow the rate of  $CO_2$  uptake from the atmosphere, 100 while contributing to ocean acidification and potentially leading to increased release of oceanic 101 102 CO<sub>2</sub> to the atmosphere (Khatiwala et al. 2009, Pendleton et al. 2012, Bauer et al. 2013, Keil 2017, Lovelock et al. 2017, Luisetti et al. 2019, LaRowe et al. 2020, Sala et al. 2021). To place 103 the effect of mobile demersal fishing in full context, it is important to better quantify the impacts 104 105 of different pressures on OC storage and to understand how these compare with natural hydrological disturbances to seabed sediments in different environmental settings 106 107 (Winterwerp and Kranenburg 2002, Pusceddu et al. 2005b, Arndt et al. 2013, Rühl et al. 2020). 108

109 The cycling and storage of OC at the seabed is highly complex and is influenced by: sediment 110 fauna, flora and microbiome; its lithology and granulometry; and the chemistry, hydrology and biology of the surrounding water column (Burdige 2007, Bauer et al. 2013, Keil 2017, 111 Middelburg 2018, Snelgrove et al. 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020, Rühl et al. 2020). With all of 112 these factors affected by many positive and negative feedback mechanisms, it is challenging 113 to definitively identify the impact of trawling and dredging on net OC storage (Keil 2017, 114 Snelgrove et al. 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020, Rühl et al. 2020). In this review we discuss the 115 potential drivers of change in sediment OC due to mobile demersal fishing activities, and 116 117 summarise empirical evidence where their effects on sediment OC has been investigated. We also discuss recent peer reviewed publications which aim to quantify the impact of mobile 118 demersal fishing at global, regional and national scales, and highlight why the results must be 119 viewed with both concern and caution (Luisetti et al. 2019, Paradis et al. 2021, Sala et al. 120 2021). If seabed sediments were to be recognised as a quantifiable and manageable blue 121 carbon resource it could unlock huge climate change mitigation potential and carbon financing 122 123 opportunities (Avelar et al. 2017, Seddon et al. 2019).

- 124
- 125

127

## 126 **2. Links between seabed sediment OC and mobile demersal fishing**

#### 128 **2.1 Production of benthic micro- and macroalgae**

129 Seabed OC is mostly allochthonous, with much of it originating from terrestrial run-off and 130 primary production in surface waters from phytoplankton, macroalgae and wetland vegetation 131 (Bauer et al. 2013, Turner 2015, Krause-Jensen and Duarte 2016, LaRowe et al. 2020, Legge et al. 2020). Through the ocean's "biological pump" much of this OC will be consumed, 132 repackaged, excreted or remineralised before a remaining proportion of OC reaches the 133 seabed (Turner 2015, Keil 2017, Middelburg 2018). On sediments in the euphotic zone, some 134 OC is autochthonous – i.e. produced *in-situ* by microphytobenthos, and by macroalgae found 135 on more stable sediments, hard substrate or attached to biogenic material (MacIntyre et al. 136 1996, Gattuso et al. 2006). 137

138

While the impact of mobile demersal fishing on benthic algae is little studied, it is known that benthic macroalgae are easily damaged by physical disturbance, and the structure and abundance of microphytobenthos is highly dependent on both natural and anthropogenic perturbation (MacIntyre et al. 1996, Fragkopoulou et al. 2021). In general, mobile demersal fishing is expected to lead to a reduction in algal cover and sediment surface chlorophyll a concentration (Fig. 1a) (Mayer et al. 1991, MacIntyre et al. 1996, Watling et al. 2001, Tiano et al. 2019, Fragkopoulou et al. 2021). For example, scallop dredging at depths of 8-15 m in the 146 Damariscotta River Estuary of the Northwest Atlantic led to clear visual disturbance of diatom 147 matts and caused a significant reduction in chlorophyll a concentration (Mayer et al. 1991, Watling et al. 2001). Among algae, kelp and coralline algae can require years and decades 148 respectively, to recover following disturbance (Dayton et al. 1992, Fragkopoulou et al. 2021). 149 150 By contrast ephemeral macroalgae and microphytobenthos can recover quickly, especially from less chronic disturbance (MacIntyre et al. 1996, Ordines et al. 2017). For example, in the 151 Pesquera Rica trawling grounds of the Balearic Islands, red algae beds of Peyssonneliaceae 152 and Corallinophycidae persist within trawled areas, although their biomass is around 39-47% 153 lower compared to untrawled areas (Ordines et al. 2017). 154

155

In some cases, especially in oligotrophic environments, disturbance from mobile demersal 156 fishing may release nutrients from sub-surface sediments and promote primary production, 157 158 increasing the density of microphytobenthos (Fig. 1a) (Fanning et al. 1982, Falcão et al. 2003, 159 Dounas et al. 2007, Palangues et al. 2014). Counteracting this, sediment suspended by fishing 160 increases turbidity (Ruffin 1998, Palanques et al. 2001) which reduces light penetration and thus photosynthetic rates (Fig. 1a) (MacIntyre et al. 1996). For example, there are contrasting 161 162 results from fishing impact studies within the Northeast Atlantic. Experimental trawling activity 163 in the Frisian Front significantly reduced chlorophyll a concentration at the sediment surface 164 (Tiano et al. 2019), whereas investigations over a range of trawling intensities in muddy sediments of the Irish Sea found a positive correlation between chlorophyll a concentration 165 and fishing frequency (Sciberras et al. 2016). 166

167

In most settings, high frequency mobile demersal fishing would be expected to reduce the 168 abundance of benthic flora on euphotic sediments and to therefore limit the quantity of OC 169 170 stored directly, and via secondary production (Fig. 1a) (Miller et al. 1996, Middelburg 2018, 171 Mandal et al. 2021). Additionally, benthic micro- and macroalgae are known to increase the stability and accumulation rate of seabed sediments (Yallop et al. 1994, Miller et al. 1996), a 172 primary driver of OC burial and storage (Middelburg 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020). This 173 represents a further mechanism through which disturbance of benthic algae from mobile 174 demersal fishing would limit the potential sequestration rate of OC within sedimentary seabed 175 176 habitats (Fig. 1a).

177

#### 178 2.2 Benthic faunal production and processing of OC

The impact of mobile demersal fishing gears on benthic fauna has been widely studied. Longterm effects on community structure and faunal biomass are site-specific and fishing gear dependent (Collie et al. 2000, Kaiser et al. 2002, Thrush and Dayton 2002, Kaiser et al. 2006, Hiddink et al. 2017, Sciberras et al. 2018). Gears which penetrate most deeply into sediment, 183 such as dredges and hydraulic gears, tend to have greater impact than gears with less 184 penetration, such as demersal seines and otter trawls (Collie et al. 2000, Kaiser et al. 2006, 185 Hiddink et al. 2017, Sciberras et al. 2018), although habitat type also has an influence (Rijnsdorp et al. 2020). The largest impacts follow initial experimental trawling events or are 186 187 seen when comparisons are made to an area of long standing protection (Thrush and Dayton 188 2002, Cook et al. 2013). Many studies may underestimate the damage done by mobile fishing gears and overestimate speed of recovery because they measure recovery of areas already 189 impacted (Collie et al. 2000, Kaiser et al. 2002, Kaiser et al. 2006, Hinz et al. 2009, Cook et 190 191 al. 2013, Hiddink et al. 2017, Sciberras et al. 2018).

192

To a greater or lesser extent, bottom trawling and dredging reduce total benthic biomass and 193 production of benthic fauna and cause loss in abundance and diversity of sessile epifauna and 194 195 long-lived shallow burrowing infauna (Kaiser et al. 2002, Queirós et al. 2006, Tillin et al. 2006, Sciberras et al. 2018, Tiano et al. 2020). Long-term fishing with mobile gears leads to 196 preponderance of small-bodied, opportunistic, motile infauna, and larger, highly vagrant, 197 198 scavenging macrofauna (Kaiser et al. 2002, Thrush and Dayton 2002, Kaiser et al. 2006, Tillin 199 et al. 2006). But even within the largely resistant opportunistic meiofauna, mobile demersal 200 fishing still affects diversity and community structure (Schratzberger et al. 2009, Pusceddu et 201 al. 2014).

202

Benthic fauna are primary drivers of carbon cycling in sediments (Middelburg 2018, Snelgrove 203 et al. 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020, Rühl et al. 2020). For example, in a well-studied area off 204 Vancouver Island, taxonomic and functional richness of benthic fauna explained a similar 205 proportion of variance in pelagic-benthic nutrient flux (~20%) when compared to a suite of 206 207 environmental variables (Belley and Snelgrove 2016, 2017). Much of the OC that reaches the 208 seabed is directly consumed by deposit and suspension feeding fauna, and is thereafter incorporated into biomass, expelled as faeces and pseudofaeces, or metabolised and 209 remineralised through respiration (Arndt et al. 2013, Keil 2017, Middelburg 2018, Snelgrove 210 et al. 2018, Rühl et al. 2020). While respiration reduces the concentration of OC available for 211 burial and storage, the consumption and processing of OC by benthic fauna may increase 212 213 proportions of refractory compounds resistant to microbial decomposition, or form specific OCmineral interactions which can isolate the OC from remineralisation processes, thus improving 214 the potential for burial and long-term storage (Fig. 1b) (Arndt et al. 2013, Middelburg 2018, 215 216 LaRowe et al. 2020).

217

Bioturbation and bio-irrigation activities generally increase OC remineralisation due to oxygenation of surface sediments and an increase in the concentration of other electron 220 acceptors, therefore promoting microbial degradation (Fig. 1b) (Hulthe et al. 1998, Arndt et al. 221 2013, Keil 2017, Snelgrove et al. 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020). However, these activities also transport OC rich surface sediments to deeper sediment layers, potentially increasing their 222 chance of burial and long-term storage (Fig. 1b) (van der Molen et al. 2012, Middelburg 2018, 223 Snelgrove et al. 2018, Rühl et al. 2020, De Borger et al. 2021). For example, in the North Sea, 224 225 bioturbation by infauna has been found to promote remineralisation by exposing buried material to oxygen (Hulthe et al. 1998) while also being significant in moving carbon from the 226 surface to deeper sediment layers (van der Molen et al. 2012, Middelburg 2018). 227

228

The composition and abundance of benthic fauna can also influence the stability and 229 accumulation rates of sediment, which are key drivers of OC burial and storage (Middelburg 230 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020). While increased bioturbation activity generally has a destabilising 231 232 effect, burrowing fauna can increase the stability and accumulation rate of sediment if there is an increase in biogenic material such as worm tubes or mucus production, or an increase in 233 234 structural complexity at the sediment surface from the presence of sedentary and sessile epifauna and biogenic habitat (Fig. 1b) (Ekdale et al. 1984, Thrush and Dayton 2002, Roberts 235 236 2007, Borsje et al. 2014, Rühl et al. 2020). For example, in fine sands and muds of the 237 Northeast Atlantic the presence of the tube building polychaete Lanice conchilege can lead to 238 increased sediment accretion rates due to changes in flow dynamics around the worm tubes, with impacts on sedimentation dynamics beyond the biogenic structure and over a longer 239 duration than the lifetime of the individual worm (Borsje et al. 2014). In contrast, in the same 240 habitat the density of the Manila clam (Ruditapes philippinarum) was positively correlated to 241 sediment erosion rates due to enhanced bioturbation activities (Sgro et al. 2005). 242

243

Faunal biomass and production are some of the main contributors of OC in seabed sediments. Therefore, the expected overall impact of mobile demersal fishing on faunal mediated processes is a reduction in OC storage, with the effect somewhat offset by reduced bioturbation and respiration causing lower remineralisation rates. Where the balance lies depends on the many complex interactions discussed above, which are site-specific.

249

250

## 251 **2.3 Alteration to sediment composition**

Mobile demersal fishing gears can alter the granulometry, topography and vertical structuring of seabed sediments (Trimmer et al. 2005, Puig et al. 2012, Martín et al. 2014b, Oberle et al. 2016a, Oberle et al. 2016b), with extent of change influenced by gear used, sediment type, local hydrology and frequency of fishing (Kaiser et al. 2002, Trimmer et al. 2005, Martín et al. 2014b, Oberle et al. 2016b). Gears that penetrate more deeply into sediment and have a larger footprint cause most impact (Kaiser et al. 2002, Martín et al. 2014b, Eigaard et al. 2016). In highly mobile habitats, the structure and composition of sediment may not be greatly altered by mobile demersal fishing due to strong natural forcing mechanisms, while those found in less hydrologically active environments could be highly affected (Kaiser et al. 2002, Trimmer et al. 2005, Martín et al. 2014b, Oberle et al. 2016b). However, greater sediment mobility may itself be a consequence of long-term use of mobile fishing gears, due to loss of fauna and flora that stabilise sediments (Roberts 2007).

264

Topographic alterations from mobile fishing gears can consist of visible trawl/dredge tracks 265 and homogenisation in large-scale seabed topography (Kaiser et al. 2002, Martín et al. 2014b, 266 Palangues et al. 2014, Eigaard et al. 2016, Oberle et al. 2016a, Oberle et al. 2016b, Tiano et 267 al. 2020). For example, multibeam surveys have shown that chronic trawling on the continental 268 slopes of the Palamós canyon in the Northwest Mediterranean has had drastic flattening 269 270 effects on soft sediments (Puig et al. 2012). Mobile demersal fishing also mixes and overturns 271 the top layer of seabed, generally causing a homogenisation of the sediment structure and an increase in density of surface sediments (Martín et al. 2014a, Pusceddu et al. 2014, Oberle et 272 273 al. 2016b, Paradis et al. 2019). The sediment's vertical profile can also be altered, with an 274 increase in coarse material towards the surface, caused by winnowing, resuspension and loss 275 of fine material (Fig. 1c) (Martín et al. 2014a, Martín et al. 2014b, Palanques et al. 2014, 276 Pusceddu et al. 2014, Mengual et al. 2016, Oberle et al. 2016b, Paradis et al. 2019). If the local hydrology is relatively depositional, the sediment may be overlain by a surface layer of 277 fine material from the re-deposition of fine sediment which has been re-suspended from 278 deeper layers (Palanques et al. 2014, Oberle et al. 2016b, Tiano et al. 2020). On the Northwest 279 Iberian shelf, all these processes and impacts were identified within a study across different 280 281 trawling intensities and environmental settings, highlighting the complexity in predicting finescale effects of mobile demersal fishing on sediment structure (Oberle et al. 2016b). 282

283

The loss of fine, flocculent material and OC-mineral interactions via mobile demersal fishing 284 is another mechanism by which OC sequestration could be reduced (Fig. 1c) (Martín et al. 285 2014b, Pusceddu et al. 2014, Oberle et al. 2016a). The physical mixing of surface sediments 286 287 generally causes an increase in oxygen penetration (Martín et al. 2014a, Tiano et al. 2019, De Borger et al. 2021), resulting in reduced OC-mineral interactions (Arnarson and Keil 2007, 288 289 Estes et al. 2019) and increased microbial respiration and remineralisation (Fig. 1c) 290 (Kristensen et al. 1995, Dauwe et al. 2001, Keil 2017, van de Velde et al. 2018). The process of physical encapsulation of OC by sediment particles and the resultant protection from 291 292 remineralisation, is seen as a key process in long term OC storage (Burdige 2007, Arndt et al. 293 2013, Estes et al. 2019, LaRowe et al. 2020). For example, in sediment samples from the Northeast Pacific coasts of Mexico and Washington state, 50% of the oldest OC stores weresorbed to mineral surfaces (Arnarson and Keil 2007).

296

297 Further, due to their often biological origin, fine grained sediments such as silts and clays typically have higher concentrations of OC compared to habitats dominated by sand and 298 coarse sediment (Burdige 2007, Paradis et al. 2021, Smeaton et al. 2021). As mobile demersal 299 fishing generally exposes or suspends fine material, this would tend to reduce overall OC 300 storage through resuspension, oxidation and remineralisation (Fig. 1c). Finally, mobile 301 demersal fishing can lead to "organic matter priming", whereby more easily degraded "labile" 302 OC at the surface is mixed with less easily degraded "recalcitrant" material. This can lead to 303 significantly increased total OC remineralisation rates, although the process is known to vary 304 between environmental settings (van Nugteren et al. 2009, Bengtsson et al. 2018, Riekenberg 305 306 et al. 2020).

307

#### 308 **2.4 Sediment resuspension and transport**

309 Large volumes of seabed sediments are sufficiently dynamic to be moved laterally and 310 vertically, and become resuspended in the water column by tides, waves and storms (Soulsby 311 1997, Winterwerp and Kranenburg 2002, Ferré et al. 2008). Mobile demersal fishing activities 312 have at times been shown to exceed, or be a large contributor to, the quantities of sediment 313 displaced by natural forcing mechanisms (Jones 1992, Pusceddu et al. 2005b, Ferré et al. 2008, Martín et al. 2014b, Pusceddu et al. 2015, Mengual et al. 2016, Oberle et al. 2016a, 314 Paradis et al. 2018). Magnitudes involved are highly dependent on depth, gear and sediment 315 type, with deeper penetrating gears and finer sediments causing larger dispersed volumes 316 (Churchill 1989, Ruffin 1998, Durrieu de Madron et al. 2005, Pusceddu et al. 2005b, Ferré et 317 al. 2008, O'Neill and Summerbell 2011, Martín et al. 2014b, Palangues et al. 2014, Mengual 318 et al. 2016, Oberle et al. 2016a). Depending on local hydrographic conditions, sediment may 319 remain in suspension for extended periods of time, and can be transported across large 320 vertical and lateral distances (Durrieu de Madron et al. 2005, Martín et al. 2006, Palangues et 321 al. 2006, Ferré et al. 2008, Martín et al. 2008, Martín et al. 2014b, Palangues et al. 2014, 322 Pusceddu et al. 2015, Oberle et al. 2016a). In the Northern Mediterranean, otter trawling 323 324 resulted in average suspended sediment concentrations ranging between 6 - 50 mg/l, depending on the study site (Palanques et al. 2001, Durrieu de Madron et al. 2005). The 325 sediment within the water column was found to persist for up to five days (Palanques et al. 326 327 2001), while off-shelf transport was 1.4 - 9 times higher when compared to sediment volumes without trawling (Ferré et al. 2008, Palanques et al. 2014). The loss of seabed topography, as 328 329 discussed above (Puig et al. 2012, Martín et al. 2014b, Oberle et al. 2016b), may also alter local-scale hydrographic conditions, increasing sediment boundary water flows and themagnitude of sediment resuspension (Smith and McLean 1977, Soulsby 1997).

332

Natural sediment disturbance during storms is known to stimulate increased water column 333 334 microbial production (Cotner et al. 2000) and higher OC remineralisation rates (Wainright and Hopkinson Jr 1997, Pusceddu et al. 2005b). In general, the resuspension and transport of 335 sediment from mobile demersal fishing will lead to a reduction in OC content (Pusceddu et al. 336 337 2005b, Martín et al. 2006, Pusceddu et al. 2015), largely due to increased oxygen exposure times and shifts between anoxic and oxic states, which generally increase remineralisation 338 rates (Fig. 1d) (Kristensen et al. 1995, Hulthe et al. 1998, Dauwe et al. 2001, Keil 2017). 339 340 Aerobic remineralisation in marine sediments has been measured at between four and ten times faster than in anaerobic conditions, however this is known to vary depending on 341 environmental settings (Kristensen et al. 1995, Hulthe et al. 1998). Fishing induced 342 disturbance may further promote remineralisation, as sediment which is deposited under oxic 343 conditions, buried under anoxia and re-exposed to oxygen can promote especially high OC 344 degradation rates (Hulthe et al. 1998). This has been identified in the biochemical signature 345 346 of suspended particulate OC within trawling grounds of the North Mediterranean, with a 347 significant shift from labile to refractory OC compounds (Pusceddu et al. 2005a, Pusceddu et 348 al. 2005b, Pusceddu et al. 2015).

349

Previous studies have shown that it is challenging to fully quantify the amount of OC that will 350 be remineralised after disturbance, rather than simply being moved elsewhere (Wainright and 351 Hopkinson Jr 1997, Pusceddu et al. 2005b, Martín et al. 2006, Martín et al. 2008, Lovelock et 352 al. 2017). There is also the potential that sediment resuspension from mobile demersal fishing 353 could increase OC storage in adjacent areas (Fig. 1d). This could occur from higher 354 355 sedimentation rates near to fishing grounds leading to increased burial of OC which is already present within the seabed, or burial of benthic algae and sessile fauna (Churchill 1989, Jones 356 1992, O'Neill and Summerbell 2011, Oberle et al. 2016a, Sciberras et al. 2016). It could also 357 lead to transportation of OC-rich shelf and slope sediments (Atwood et al. 2020) to deeper 358 waters below mixing depths (Fig. 1d) (Caldeira et al. 2002, Martín et al. 2006, Ferré et al. 359 360 2008, Martín et al. 2008, Paradis et al. 2018, Legge et al. 2020). Such off-shelf induced transport of sediment and OC has been recorded as deep as 1750 m in continental slope 361 trawling grounds of the Palamós canyon in the Northwest Mediterranean (Martín et al. 2006, 362 363 Palanques et al. 2006, Martín et al. 2008).

364

Overall, increased sediment resuspension from mobile demersal fishing would be expected to reduce the current store of OC in seabed sediments due to disturbance of accumulations and increased oxygen exposure times (Keil 2017, Luisetti et al. 2019, De Borger et al. 2021).
Future sequestration would also be limited as newly settling organic material would be kept in
suspension, precluding it from burial and storage (Churchill 1989, Ruffin 1998, Martín et al.
2014b, Oberle et al. 2016a). The magnitude of impact, however, will be largely based on local
hydrography, which primarily determines the fate of resuspended OC (Wainright and
Hopkinson Jr 1997, Ferré et al. 2008).

373

#### 374 **2.5 Alteration in pelagic primary production**

375 As most seabed OC is allochthonous, the total amount which reaches seabed sediments is strongly driven by the level of primary production in the overlying water column (Seiter et al. 376 2004, Turner 2015, Atwood et al. 2020). As noted previously, sediment disturbance by mobile 377 378 fishing gears, or natural forces, can release significant concentrations of nutrients into the 379 water column (Fanning et al. 1982, Falcão et al. 2003, Polymenakou et al. 2005, Palanques 380 et al. 2014). In shallower areas, released nutrients will likely enter into or remain in the euphotic 381 zone, where their fertilisation effect can increase phytoplankton primary production (Fig. 1e), (Fanning et al. 1982, Dounas et al. 2007, Palangues et al. 2014). For example, modelling 382 predictions from trawling experiments in the Eastern Mediterranean at Heraklion Bay, estimate 383 that nutrient upwelling from bottom trawling could increase net annual primary production by 384 385 15% (Dounas et al. 2007) with subsequent settlement raising OC in seabed sediments (Falcão et al. 2003, Polymenakou et al. 2005, Palangues et al. 2014, Turner 2015). Alongside this, as 386 discussed for microphytobenthos, demersal fishing activity can also reduce rates of 387 photosynthesis by increasing turbidity (Fig. 1e), (Ruffin 1998, Palanques et al. 2001, Adriano 388 389 et al. 2005, Cloern et al. 2014).

390

#### **2.6 The contribution of vertebrate fauna to OC storage**

392 Although not a focus of this review, the removal of vertebrate species by benthic and pelagic 393 fisheries could influence the mass of OC stored in seabed sediments (Pershing et al. 2010, 394 Atwood et al. 2015, Mariani et al. 2020). The emerging field of "fish carbon" describes the 395 contribution of vertebrate fauna to OC storage and sequestration within seabed sediments 396 from defecation, pelagic mixing, bioturbation, trophic interactions and deadfall (Trueman et al. 2014, Turner 2015, Saba et al. 2021). Although the magnitudes of effect are poorly resolved, 397 the reduction in population size and average body size of marine vertebrates that results from 398 over-harvest, is expected to reduce the amount of carbon exported to the seabed (Fig. 1f) 399 (Pershing et al. 2010, Trueman et al. 2014, Atwood et al. 2015, Mariani et al. 2020). For 400 example, since 1950, the combined catch of Tuna, Mackerel, Shark and Billfish is estimated 401 to have prevented approximately 21.8 Mt of OC being stored in seabed sediments (Mariani et 402 403 al. 2020). The removal of predatory vertebrates will also cause trophic cascades, potentially leading to alterations in benthic faunal communities, triggering the feedback mechanisms onOC discussed above (Atwood et al. 2015).

406

#### 407 **2.7 Interactions and feedback mechanisms**

All factors discussed here interact in a variety of positive and negative feedback loops. For 408 example, alterations in sediment characteristics will influence the community structure of 409 benthic flora and fauna, and vice versa. Additionally, pelagic primary production, trophic 410 interactions, and the abundance and community composition of vertebrate fauna will all further 411 alter benthic population changes induced by mobile demersal fishing. These factors are also 412 413 influenced by chemical and physical oceanographic processes that are outside the scope of this review. The structure and diversity of the microbiome is also strongly influenced by the 414 composition of benthic flora and fauna (Middelburg 2018, LaRowe et al. 2020, Rühl et al. 415 2020). However, the microbiome itself can be impacted by mobile demersal fishing activities 416 adding further complexity to the overall picture (Watling et al. 2001, Polymenakou et al. 2005). 417

418

#### 419 **3. Experimental results**

From a systematic literature search (see Supplementary material), 40 peer-reviewed studies 420 421 were identified which investigated the impact of mobile demersal fishing on the seabed, and directly measured OC or organic matter (OM) and/or remineralisation rates in seabed 422 sediments (Table 1). The 40 studies covered 12 oceanic realms with greatest representation 423 424 from the Northeast Atlantic (43%), Mediterranean (23%) and Northwest Atlantic (15%). The majority of studies (58%) investigated the impacts of commercial fishing activities. The 425 remainder either used experimental trawling/dredging methods (33%), a mixture of 426 experimental trawling and monitoring of commercial fishing (5%), or mathematical modelling 427 428 of fishing impacts (5%). A variety of experimental setups were employed including impactcontrol site comparisons (43%), before-after fishing impact (23%), and low-high impact 429 430 contrasts which lacked controls (20%). Additionally, 13% of studies used a before-after control-impact design either alone or in combination with an impact-control experiment; and 431 one investigated the recovery of seabed sediment OC after a long-term closure to mobile 432 demersal fishing (Table 1). It should be noted that for many of these studies, in areas 433 434 considered "control sites" there is the potential for them to still be affected by mobile demersal 435 fishing activities. This often occurs due to insufficient monitoring (e.g. no Vessel Monitoring System data on smaller vessels), lack of enforcement (i.e. within a supposed closed area) or 436 lack of recovery time since cessation of fishing, particularly given the long timescales of 437 recovery expected for many habitats (Roberts 2007). 438

Of the 40 studies identified, 11 investigated the effect of mobile demersal fishing across multiple sites, habitat types or gear-types, and made inferences for each investigation separately (Table 1); this produced a total of 62 experimental contrasts (Table S1). Of these, 59 measured changes in OC/OM concentration. A finding of no significant effect was reported in 51% of contrasts; 41% reported lower OC in fished sites compared to unfished control sites (or in areas with higher fishing intensities), with 8% reporting higher OC (Table S1).

446

Studies which reported a negative impact from mobile demersal fishing on OC generally 447 occurred in muddy sediments, while those which reported higher OC in response to this 448 disturbance, or no effect, occurred in a mixture of sandy and muddy sediments (Table S1). On 449 average, the duration of impact was higher for studies which reported a negative effect of 450 demersal fishing on OC, when compared to those which reported a positive or non-significant 451 452 effect, with estimated values of median impact duration at 36 months and 18 months 453 respectively (Table S1). Most that reported a negative impact from demersal fishing were 454 Impact-Control studies (75%) or Before-After fishing impact studies (13%). In contrast, those that reported no significant effects were predominantly Low-High impact studies lacking 455 controls (43%) and Impact-Control studies (27%). The 5 studies which reported an increase 456 457 in OC were relatively evenly spread between Impact-Control designs (60%) and Before-After 458 designs (40%). The median depth at which the research was conducted was relatively similar 459 between different experimental outcomes, with median depths of 22 m, 31 m and 20 m, for 460 studies which reported a decrease, no significant effect, and an increase in OC respectively (Table S1). 461

462

Within the literature examined, there were 18 inferences about the impact of mobile demersal 463 fishing pressure on sediment carbon remineralisation rate. Of these, 78% reported that 464 465 demersal fishing activity decreased remineralisation rate in seabed sediments, with the rest concluding opposite (Table S1). Although no clear trend was identified between studies, it 466 seems the result is highly dependent on local hydrographic conditions. For example, in more 467 depositional environments, mobile demersal fishing may cause oxygenation of sediments and 468 redeposition of recently expulsed organic material back to the seabed, leading to an increase 469 470 in remineralisation rate (Duplisea et al. 2001, Polymenakou et al. 2005, van de Velde et al. 2018). In more hydrologically active environments, resuspension and lateral/vertical transport 471 of sediments would be expected to reduce OC in surface sediments which, along with removal 472 473 of fauna, could limit the rate of remineralisation (Pusceddu et al. 2014, Tiano et al. 2019, De 474 Borger et al. 2021, Morys et al. 2021).

476 The evidence discussed earlier in Section 2 would suggest that removing or reducing 477 demersal fishing pressure from the seabed would have net benefits to carbon sequestration 478 and storage. However, the experimental results identified here indicate study-specific and sitespecific outcomes. The majority of studies which identified no significant effect in sediment 479 480 OC used an experimental design which compared sites with different magnitudes of fishing impact but lacked controls. There is a clear need for further identification and investigation of 481 seabed sediment habitats that have had true long-term protection from demersal fishing. 482 Those studies which reported an increase in OC, or no effect, also generally occurred in 483 sandier sediments which may be subjected to higher levels of natural disturbance; however, 484 as highlighted in this review, there will also be sandier areas where the impact of fishing activity 485 outweighs natural forcing mechanisms. Finally, many of the studies identified in the systematic 486 review were not primarily designed to investigate the impact of demersal fishing on carbon 487 488 storage or remineralisation, although this may not affect the direction of their conclusions.

489

### 490 **4. Future research**

- As highlighted by the varied results, there is a clear need for further research into the potential 491 impact of mobile demersal fishing on OC sequestration and storage in seabed sediments. 492 493 Recent first order estimates have suggested that globally, mobile demersal fishing could remineralise between 160 - 400 Mt of OC from marine sediment stores annually (Sala et al. 494 495 2021). It has also been suggested that historical trawling on global continental slopes could have removed ~6000 Mt of OC from the upper-most centimetre of sediment alone (Paradis et 496 497 al. 2021). In addition, it has been estimated that ~2 Mt of OC is remineralised from UK shelf sediments each year by mobile demersal fishing (Luisetti et al. 2019). Although these 498 499 estimates contain large generalisations, their scale reveals the massive potential for mobile 500 demersal fishing to reduce carbon stores.
- 501

502 Following disturbance by mobile demersal fishing a proportion of OC will be remineralised in the benthos or in the water column, however some will simply remain in-situ and be re-buried, 503 504 and a further proportion will be transported over a range of distances either being consumed or re-buried (Pendleton et al. 2012, Lovelock et al. 2017). A key research gap is the 505 506 quantification of OC that follows each of these processes in different environmental settings and under different types of fishing impact. Sala et al. (2021) only account for remineralisation 507 of disturbed OC which remains in-situ or resettles within 1 km<sup>2</sup>, as they consider the fate of 508 509 sediment which stays in suspension as unknown. In their paper, Sala et al. (2021) consider 510 that 87% of the OC disturbed remains in-situ or resettles uniformly across global fishing effort, and of this anything between 1-69.3% will be remineralised, with the magnitude dependent 511 512 upon two relatively coarse metrics, namely: estimated proportion of OC which is labile, and 513 oceanic basin degradation rate. In contrast, Luisetti et al. (2019) use an upper estimate that 514 100% of the OC resuspended by mobile demersal fishing will be remineralised, but they do 515 not consider the fate of OC that is disturbed but remains in-situ. Although both studies give a representation to the scale of OC which may be lost, improved quantification of these metrics 516 is clearly needed before accurate measures of OC lost, or inorganic carbon produced, can be 517 quantified. OC in seabed sediments is not naturally inert, passing through a range of aerobic 518 and anaerobic remineralisation pathways to varying sediment depths. Thus more 519 consideration is needed to understand the influence of natural remineralisation rates within 520 521 seabed sediments under different environmental settings, and therefore quantify the additional 522 effect of mobile demersal fishing in each area. In seabed sediment habitats with high hydrodynamic activity, low deposition rates, and high oxygen penetration depths, the 523 additional disturbance of demersal fishing on OC may be more limited. 524

525

We must also consider the cumulative or finite nature of disturbance by demersal mobile 526 527 fishing on OC stores. It is not clear how much of the estimated 360 Gt of OC in the top 1 m of 528 sediment is actually under threat (Atwood et al. 2020). While mobile demersal fishing can only 529 penetrate between around 2 and 20 cm into the sediment (Hiddink et al. 2017), repeated 530 chronic impacts may continue to disturb and displace sediment more deeply (Sala et al. 2021). 531 It is possible, that in chronically fished areas significant further loss of OC stores will not occur due to historic depletion in OC stocks. However, in such areas carbon sequestration and 532 accumulation of OC would be limited by the frequency of disturbance to newly settled material 533 (Sala et al. 2021). By contrast, if new fishing grounds emerge, these could act as huge sources 534 of carbon emissions as sediment becomes disturbed and OC is remineralised (Gogarty et al. 535 2020). 536

537

538 There is also a need to identify a clear baseline from which changes in OC can be measured. Standing stock of OC in global seabed sediments is relatively well resolved at a number of 539 spatial scales (e.g. Seiter et al. 2004, Lee et al. 2019, Luisetti et al. 2019, Atwood et al. 2020, 540 Legge et al. 2020, Diesing et al. 2021, Smeaton et al. 2021). However, precise estimates of 541 542 OC remineralisation, accumulation and burial rates are generally lacking (Berner 1982, Burdige 2007, Keil 2017, Wilkinson et al. 2018, Luisetti et al. 2019, Legge et al. 2020, Diesing 543 et al. 2021). Any studies which aim to quantify the impact of demersal fishing on carbon 544 storage and sequestration must therefore quantify both the before and after scenarios for 545 546 robust conclusions to be drawn.

547

548 It is important that future research into the impact of mobile demersal fishing on carbon storage 549 is focused in areas which are expected to contain significant stocks of OC or have large future 550 sequestration potential, based on their geographic projections (Atwood et al. 2020), sediment 551 characteristics (Smeaton et al. 2021) and local hydrology (Lee et al. 2019). Research should 552 also focus on areas that overlap with significant mobile demersal fishing pressure (Amoroso 553 et al. 2018, Kroodsma et al. 2018, Sala et al. 2021), and where this can be compared to areas 554 that could be considered truly "unfished", either from well enforced protected areas or specific 555 environmental settings.

556

On land, retrospective analyses of changes in human use and vegetation cover have been 557 critical to estimating how people have altered the planetary carbon cycle. It is vital that this 558 559 historical context is considered when further investigating the potential impact of mobile 560 demersal fishing on global seabed OC sequestration and storage, and the opportunities for recovery if this pressure is removed. Due to the extended timeframes needed for some seabed 561 562 habitats to fully recover, true long-term protection and monitoring of OC is needed to fully 563 deduce carbon storage potential. Without considering areas of seabed that have experienced 564 genuine long-term protection, it is not possible to gain a true baseline from which impacts can 565 be compared (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). Within this review, only one study could be 566 found which looked at the direct recovery of OC in seabed sediments following the medium-567 to-long term removal of fishing pressure (Wang et al. 2021). Gaining further evidence is vital 568 to understand how much OC can accumulate when mobile demersal fishing is removed, and 569 how this may change over the course of recovery.

570

#### 571 **5. Concluding remarks**

572 Seabed sediments are one of the planet's primary OC stores and strongly influence the 573 oceanic sink for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (Gruber et al. 2019, Atwood et al. 2020, Watson et al. 2020, 574 Sala et al. 2021). It is an urgent priority to better understand the effect of mobile fishing gear use on seabed OC sequestration and storage, and to incorporate clear blue carbon 575 considerations into global seabed management. As only around 2-3% of the world's seabed 576 is currently closed to trawling and dredging (Roberts et al. 2017, Marine Conservation Institute 577 2021), increasing the scale of protection could offer huge climate change mitigation potential 578 and bring corresponding gains in biodiversity (Roberts et al. 2017, Seddon et al. 2019, Roberts 579 et al. 2020, Sala et al. 2021). Across the world, mobile demersal fisheries are highly fuel 580 581 inefficient and produce most of the fishing industry's direct greenhouse gas emissions (Parker et al. 2018). A shift to less damaging fishing methods could provide major net benefits for 582 increasing natural carbon sequestration and storage in the seabed, whilst significantly 583 584 reducing emissions of CO<sub>2</sub>.

The results of recent regional and global scale publications which calculated first-order 586 estimates of CO<sub>2</sub> produced from disturbance to seabed sediments by mobile demersal fishing 587 must be taken with both concern and caution (Luisetti et al. 2019, Paradis et al. 2021, Sala et 588 589 al. 2021). As identified in this review, demersal fishing by trawling and dredging is in many 590 cases likely to limit the storage and sequestration of OC, but to draw firm conclusions more 591 experimental studies covering a wide range of environmental settings, habitat types and 592 fishing pressures is required to address the large number of unknowns and site-specific drivers associated with the status of OC on the seabed. 593

bioRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.07.450307; this version posted July 9, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.



595

Figure 1. The effects of mobile demersal fishing activity (right) and absence of demersal 596 fishing activity (left) on a) benthic algae, b) benthic infauna and epifauna, c) sediment 597 598 characteristics, d) sediment dynamics, e) pelagic primary production, f) vertebrate fauna, and how each of these changes may impact seabed sediment organic carbon (OC) stores. 599 Addition symbols indicate when a factor/process would be expected to increase in the 600 presence/absence of fishing; inhibitory arrows indicate when a factor/process would be 601 602 expected to decrease. The colour of the addition/inhibition symbols indicates whether this change is predicted to impact OC sequestration and storage either positively (green) or 603 negatively 604 (red). Symbols courtesy of Integration and Application Network (ian.umces.edu/media-library) 605

**Table 1.** Summary of studies which investigated the impact of mobile demersal fishing on the seabed and directly measured organic carbon (OC) or organic matter (OM), and/or remineralisation rates of OC/OM in the sediment. The last two columns indicate whether the presence or increase in demersal fishing activity was reported to cause lower (red), higher (green), no significant effect (orange) or mixed effects (grey) in the concentration or mass of OC/OM ("OC/OM"), or organic carbon remineralisation rate ("Remin' rate"), within seabed sediments.

Reference	Oceanic region	Sediment	Depth (m BCD)	Gear	Study type	Impact type	Impact duration	Cont- rasts	OC/ OM	Remin' rate
Adriano et al. (2005)	N Mediterranean	Sandy-mud	~1	Clam dredge	BA	Commercial fishing	5 yrs	1		
Atkinson et al. (2011)	SE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	346-459	Otter-trawl	LH	Commercial fishing	1-4 yrs data	1		
Bhagirathan et al. (2010)	N Indian	Mud	15-40	Otter-trawl	BA	Experimental	15 months	1		
Brown et al. (2005)	NE Pacific	Muddy-sand	25-35	Otter-trawl	BACI IC	Experimental Commercial fishing	1 day 10 yrs	2		
De Borger et al. (2021)	NE Atlantic	Mud & Sand	9-148	Mixed trawls	IC-LH	Modelled	15 yrs data	10		
Dolmer et al. (2001)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	7	Mussel dredge	IC	Experimental	< 1 month	1		
Duplisea et al. (2001)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	~50	Beam trawl	IC-LH	Modelled	n.d.	1		
Eleftheriou and Robertson (1992)	NE Atlantic	Sand	~7	Scallop dredge	ВА	Experimental	9 days	1		
Ferguson et al. (2020)	SW Pacific	Muddy-sand	4	Otter trawl	BACI	Experimental	3 months	1		
Fiordelmondo et al. (2003)	N Mediterranean	Sand	~2	Clam dredge	IC	Experimental	1 day	1		
Goldberg et al. (2014)	NW Atlantic	Fine sand	3-5	Hydraulic dredge	IC	Experimental	1 day	1		
Hale et al. (2017)	NE Atlantic	Mud & Sand	19-29	Otter trawl & Scallop dredge	LH	Commercial fishing	2+ yrs data	2		
Lamarque et al. (2021)	NE Atlantic	Sandy-mud	33-78	Mixed trawls	LH	Commercial fishing	n.d.	1	*	
Lindeboom and de Groot (1998)	NE Atlantic	Mud & Sand	30-75	Mixed trawls	BACI IC	Experimental Commercial fishing	15 months 5-50 yrs	3		
Liu et al. (2011)	W Pacific	Sandy-mud	20	Mixed trawls	IC	Commercial fishing	1-2 yrs	1		
Martín et al. (2014a)	NW Mediterranean	Mud	453-591	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	3+ yrs data	1		
Mayer et al. (1991)	NW Atlantic	Mud & Mixed	8-20	Otter trawl & Scallop dredge	IC	Experimental	1 day	2		
McLaverty et al. (2020)	NE Atlantic	Sandy-mud	3-11	Mussel dredge	LH	Commercial fishing	1.5 yrs data	4	*	
Mercaldo-Allen et al. (2016)	NW Atlantic	Fine sand	3-5	Hydraulic dredge	IC	Experimental	1 day	1		
Meseck et al. (2014)	NW Atlantic	Fine sand	5-6	Hydraulic dredge	BACI	Experimental	1 day	1		
Morys et al. (2021)	Baltic	Muddy-sand	12	Benthic Dredge	IC	Experimental	1 day	1		
Palanques et al. (2014)	NW Mediterranean	Mud	40-70	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	2 yrs data	1		
Paradis et al. (2019)	SW Mediterranean	Mud	550	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	9 yrs data	1		
Paradis et al. (2021)	NW Mediterranean	Mud	425-494	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	1+ yrs data	1		
Polymenakou et al. (2005)	NE Mediterranean	Sandy-mud	30-51	Otter trawl	BA	Commercial fishing	8 months	1		
Pusceddu et al. (2005a)	NE Mediterranean	Sandy-mud	30-80	Otter trawl	BA	Commercial fishing	8 months	1		
Pusceddu et al. (2014)	NW Mediterranean	Mud	454-556	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	3 yrs data	1		
Rajesh et al. (2019)	N Indian	Sand	5-35	Beam trawl	BA	Experimental	4 days	2		
Ramalho et al. (2018)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	285-550	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	2+ yrs data	1		
Ramalho et al. (2020)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	285-550	Otter trawl	LH	Commercial fishing	2+ yrs data	1		
Rosli et al. (2016)	SW Pacific	Sandy-mud	670-1561	Otter trawl	LH	Commercial fishing	31 yrs data	2	*	
Sciberras et al. (2016)	NE Atlantic	Mud & Sand	20-43	Otter trawl & Scallop dredge	LH	Commercial fishing	3 yrs data	2		
Serpetti et al. (2013)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	769-823	Mixed trawls	IC	Commercial fishing	~10 yrs	1		
Sheridan and Doerr (2005)	NW Atlantic	Mud & Sand	5-20	Otter trawl	IC	Commercial fishing	7 months	1		
Smith (2000)	NE Mediterranean	Sandy-mud	~200	Otter trawl	BACI	Commercial fishing	7 months data	1		
Tiano et al. (2019)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	34	Mixed trawls	BA	Experimental	1 day	2		
Trimmer et al. (2005)	NE Atlantic	Muddy-sand	~20-80	Beam trawl	LH	Commercial fishing	3 yrs data	2	*	
van de Velde et al. (2018)	NE Atlantic	Mud	~7	Unknown	BA	Commercial fishing	< 1 month	1		
Wang et al. (2021)	W Pacific	Mud & Sand	1-28	Mixed trawls	Recovery	Commercial fishing	2.5 yrs	1		
Watling et al. (2001)	NW Atlantic	Muddy-sand	15	Scallop dredge	BA	Experimental	1 day	1	*	

For "Study type": BA = Before-after fishing impact, IC = Impact-control site comparison, LH = low to high impacted sites, BACI = before-after controlimpact, "Recovery" = change after removal of commercial fishing. For "Impact duration": those suffixed with "data" indicate where the exact duration of impact is unknown and the stated time is the period for which data was available "Contrasts" = the number of experimental contrasts conducted in each study. For "OC/OM" those with an asterisk (\*) indicate where further analysis was needed – see Supplementary material. The "OC/OM" column is empty for Polymenakou et al. (2005) as the result was based on the same data which is reported in Pusceddu et al. (2005a). n.d. = no data.

# 618619 Bibliography

- 621 Adriano, S., F. Massimiliano, C. Sonia, F. Chiara, and A. Marcomini. 2005. Organic carbon changes in 622 the surface sediments of the Venice Iagoon. Environment International **31**:1002-1010.
- 623 Amoroso, R. O., C. R. Pitcher, A. D. Rijnsdorp, R. A. McConnaughey, A. M. Parma, P. Suuronen, O. R. 624 Eigaard, F. Bastardie, N. T. Hintzen, F. Althaus, S. J. Baird, J. Black, L. Buhl-Mortensen, A. B. 625 Campbell, R. Catarino, J. Collie, J. H. Cowan, Jr., D. Durholtz, N. Engstrom, T. P. Fairweather, H. 626 O. Fock, R. Ford, P. A. Galvez, H. Gerritsen, M. E. Gongora, J. A. Gonzalez, J. G. Hiddink, K. M. 627 Hughes, S. S. Intelmann, C. Jenkins, P. Jonsson, P. Kainge, M. Kangas, J. N. Kathena, S. Kavadas, 628 R. W. Leslie, S. G. Lewis, M. Lundy, D. Makin, J. Martin, T. Mazor, G. Gonzalez-Mirelis, S. J. 629 Newman, N. Papadopoulou, P. E. Posen, W. Rochester, T. Russo, A. Sala, J. M. Semmens, C. Silva, A. Tsolos, B. Vanelslander, C. B. Wakefield, B. A. Wood, R. Hilborn, M. J. Kaiser, and S. 630 631 Jennings. 2018. Bottom trawl fishing footprints on the world's continental shelves. 632 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA **115**:E10275-E10282.
- Arnarson, T. S., and R. G. Keil. 2007. Changes in organic matter–mineral interactions for marine
  sediments with varying oxygen exposure times. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta **71**:35453556.
- Arndt, S., B. B. Jørgensen, D. E. LaRowe, J. J. Middelburg, R. D. Pancost, and P. Regnier. 2013.
  Quantifying the degradation of organic matter in marine sediments: A review and synthesis.
  Earth-Science Reviews 123:53-86.
- Atkinson, L. J., J. G. Field, and L. Hutchings. 2011. Effects of demersal trawling along the west coast of
   southern Africa: multivariate analysis of benthic assemblages. Marine Ecology Progress Series
   430:241-255.
- Atwood, T. B., R. M. Connolly, E. G. Ritchie, C. E. Lovelock, M. R. Heithaus, G. C. Hays, J. W. Fourqurean,
  and P. I. Macreadie. 2015. Predators help protect carbon stocks in blue carbon ecosystems.
  Nature Climate Change 5:1038-1045.
- Atwood, T. B., A. Witt, J. Mayorga, E. Hammill, and E. Sala. 2020. Global Patterns in Marine Sediment
   Carbon Stocks. Frontiers in Marine Science **7**:165.
- Avelar, S., T. S. van der Voort, and T. I. Eglinton. 2017. Relevance of carbon stocks of marine sediments
   for national greenhouse gas inventories of maritime nations. Carbon Balance and
   Management 12:10.
- Bauer, J. E., W.-J. Cai, P. A. Raymond, T. S. Bianchi, C. S. Hopkinson, and P. A. G. Regnier. 2013. The
   changing carbon cycle of the coastal ocean. Nature 504:61-70.
- 652 Belley, R., and P. V. R. Snelgrove. 2016. Relative Contributions of Biodiversity and Environment to 653 Benthic Ecosystem Functioning. Frontiers in Marine Science **3**:242.
- Belley, R., and P. V. R. Snelgrove. 2017. The role of infaunal functional and species diversity in short term response of contrasting benthic communities to an experimental food pulse. Journal of
   Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 491:38-50.
- Bengtsson, M. M., K. Attermeyer, and N. Catalán. 2018. Interactive effects on organic matter
   processing from soils to the ocean: are priming effects relevant in aquatic ecosystems?
   Hydrobiologia 822:1-17.
- Berner, R. A. 1982. Burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulfur in the modern ocean; its geochemical
   and environmental significance. American Journal of Science 282:451-473.
- Bhagirathan, U., B. Meenakumari, K. V. Jayalakshmy, S. K. Panda, V. R. Madhu, and D. T. Vaghela. 2010.
   Impact of bottom trawling on sediment characteristics a study along inshore waters off
   Veraval coast, India. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment 160:355-369.
- Borsje, B. W., T. J. Bouma, M. Rabaut, P. M. J. Herman, and S. J. M. H. Hulscher. 2014. Formation and
   erosion of biogeomorphological structures: A model study on the tube-building polychaete
   Lanice conchilega. Limnology and Oceanography 59:1297-1309.

- Brown, E. J., B. Finney, M. Dommisse, and S. Hills. 2005. Effects of commercial otter trawling on the
   physical environment of the southeastern Bering Sea. Continental Shelf Research 25:1281 1301.
- Burdige, D. J. 2007. Preservation of Organic Matter in Marine Sediments: Controls, Mechanisms, and
   an Imbalance in Sediment Organic Carbon Budgets? Chemical Reviews 107:467-485.
- Caldeira, K., M. E. Wickett, and P. B. Duffy. 2002. Depth, radiocarbon, and the effectiveness of direct
   CO2 injection as an ocean carbon sequestration strategy. Geophysical Research Letters 29:13 11-13-14.
- 676 Churchill, J. H. 1989. The effect of commercial trawling on sediment resuspension and transport over
   677 the Middle Atlantic Bight continental shelf. Continental Shelf Research **9**:841-865.
- Cloern, J. E., S. Q. Foster, and A. E. Kleckner. 2014. Phytoplankton primary production in the world's
   estuarine-coastal ecosystems. Biogeosciences 11:2477-2501.
- Collie, J. S., S. J. Hall, M. J. Kaiser, and I. R. Poiner. 2000. A quantitative analysis of fishing impacts on
   shelf-sea benthos. Journal of Animal Ecology 69:785-798.
- Cook, R., J. M. Fariñas-Franco, F. R. Gell, R. H. F. Holt, T. Holt, C. Lindenbaum, J. S. Porter, R. Seed, L. R.
  Skates, T. B. Stringell, and W. G. Sanderson. 2013. The Substantial First Impact of Bottom
  Fishing on Rare Biodiversity Hotspots: A Dilemma for Evidence-Based Conservation. PLoS One
  8:e69904.
- 686 Cotner, J. B., T. H. Johengen, and B. A. Biddanda. 2000. Intense winter heterotrophic production
   687 stimulated by benthic resuspension. Limnology and Oceanography 45:1672-1676.
- Dauwe, B., J. J. Middelburg, and P. M. J. Herman. 2001. Effect of oxygen on the degradability of organic
   matter in subtidal and intertidal sediments of the North Sea area. Marine Ecology Progress
   Series 215:13-22.
- Dayton, P. K., M. J. Tegner, P. E. Parnell, and P. B. Edwards. 1992. Temporal and Spatial Patterns of
   Disturbance and Recovery in a Kelp Forest Community. Ecological Monographs 62:421-445.
- De Borger, E., J. Tiano, U. Braeckman, A. D. Rijnsdorp, and K. Soetaert. 2021. Impact of bottom trawling
   on sediment biogeochemistry: a modelling approach. Biogeosciences 18:2539–2557.
- Diesing, M., T. Thorsnes, and L. R. Bjarnadóttir. 2021. Organic carbon densities and accumulation rates
   in surface sediments of the North Sea and Skagerrak. Biogeosciences 18:2139-2160.
- Dolmer, P., T. Kristensen, M. L. Christiansen, M. F. Petersen, P. S. Kristensen, and E. Hoffmann. 2001.
   Short-term impact of blue mussel dredging (Mytilus edulis L.) on a benthic community.
   Hydrobiologia 465:115-127.
- Dounas, C., I. Davies, G. Triantafyllou, P. Koulouri, G. Petihakis, C. Arvanitidis, G. Sourlatzis, and A.
   Eleftheriou. 2007. Large-scale impacts of bottom trawling on shelf primary productivity.
   Continental Shelf Research 27:2198-2210.
- Duarte, C. M. 2017. Reviews and syntheses: Hidden forests, the role of vegetated coastal habitats in
   the ocean carbon budget. Biogeosciences 14:301-310.
- Duarte, C. M., I. J. Losada, I. E. Hendriks, I. Mazarrasa, and N. Marbà. 2013. The role of coastal plant
   communities for climate change mitigation and adaptation. Nature Climate Change 3:961 968.
- Duplisea, D. E., S. Jennings, S. J. Malcolm, R. Parker, and D. B. Sivyer. 2001. Modelling potential impacts
   of bottom trawl fisheries on soft sediment biogeochemistry in the North Sea. Geochemical
   Transactions 2:112.
- Durrieu de Madron, X., B. Ferré, G. Le Corre, C. Grenz, P. Conan, M. Pujo-Pay, R. Buscail, and O. Bodiot.
   2005. Trawling-induced resuspension and dispersal of muddy sediments and dissolved
   elements in the Gulf of Lion (NW Mediterranean). Continental Shelf Research 25:2387-2409.
- Figaard, O. R., F. Bastardie, M. Breen, G. E. Dinesen, N. T. Hintzen, P. Laffargue, L. O. Mortensen, J. R.
  Nielsen, H. C. Nilsson, F. G. O'Neill, H. Polet, D. G. Reid, A. Sala, M. Sköld, C. Smith, T. K.
  Sørensen, O. Tully, M. Zengin, and A. D. Rijnsdorp. 2016. Estimating seabed pressure from
  demersal trawls, seines, and dredges based on gear design and dimensions. ICES Journal of
  Marine Science **73**:i27-i43.

- Ekdale, A., R. Bromley, and S. Pemberton. 1984. Effects of Bioturbation on Sediment Properties.
   Ichnology: The Use of Trace Fossils in Sedimentology and Stratigraphy. Soceity for
   Sedimentary Geology, USA, Special Publications of SEPM.
- Eleftheriou, A., and M. R. Robertson. 1992. The effects of experimental scallop dredging on the fauna and physical environment of a shallow sandy community. Netherlands Journal of Sea Research
   30:289-299.
- Estes, E. R., R. Pockalny, S. D'Hondt, F. Inagaki, Y. Morono, R. W. Murray, D. Nordlund, A. J. Spivack, S.
   D. Wankel, N. Xiao, and C. M. Hansel. 2019. Persistent organic matter in oxic subseafloor
   sediment. Nature Geoscience 12:126-131.
- Falcão, M., M. B. Gaspar, M. Caetano, M. N. Santos, and C. Vale. 2003. Short-term environmental
   impact of clam dredging in coastal waters (south of Portugal): chemical disturbance and
   subsequent recovery of seabed. Marine Environmental Research 56:649-664.
- Fanning, K. A., K. L. Carder, and P. R. Betzer. 1982. Sediment resuspension by coastal waters: a
  potential mechanism for nutrient re-cycling on the ocean's margins. Deep Sea Research Part
  A. Oceanographic Research Papers 29:953-965.
- Ferguson, A. J. P., J. Oakes, and B. D. Eyre. 2020. Bottom trawling reduces benthic denitrification and
   has the potential to influence the global nitrogen cycle. Limnology and Oceanography Letters
   5:237-245.
- Ferré, B., X. Durrieu de Madron, C. Estournel, C. Ulses, and G. Le Corre. 2008. Impact of natural (waves and currents) and anthropogenic (trawl) resuspension on the export of particulate matter to the open ocean: Application to the Gulf of Lion (NW Mediterranean). Continental Shelf Research 28:2071-2091.
- Fiordelmondo, C., E. Manini, C. Gambi, and A. Pusceddu. 2003. Short-term impact of clam harvesting
   on sediment chemistry, benthic microbes and meiofauna in the Goro Lagoon (Italy). Chemistry
   and Ecology 19:173-187.
- Fragkopoulou, E., E. A. Serrão, P. A. Horta, G. Koerich, and J. Assis. 2021. Bottom trawling threatens
   future climate refugia of rhodoliths globally. Frontiers in Marine Science 7:1246.
- Gattuso, J. P., B. Gentili, C. M. Duarte, J. A. Kleypas, J. J. Middelburg, and D. Antoine. 2006. Light
   availability in the coastal ocean: impact on the distribution of benthic photosynthetic
   organisms and their contribution to primary production. Biogeosciences 3:489-513.
- Gogarty, B., J. McGee, D. K. A. Barnes, C. J. Sands, N. Bax, M. Haward, R. Downey, C. Moreau, B.
   Moreno, C. Held, and M. L. Paulsen. 2020. Protecting Antarctic blue carbon: as marine ice
   retreats can the law fill the gap? Climate Policy 20:149-162.
- Goldberg, R., J. M. Rose, R. Mercaldo-Allen, S. L. Meseck, P. Clark, C. Kuropat, and J. J. Pereira. 2014.
   Effects of hydraulic dredging on the benthic ecology and sediment chemistry on a cultivated
   bed of the Northern quahog, Mercenaria mercenaria. Aquaculture 428:150-157.
- Gruber, N., D. Clement, B. R. Carter, R. A. Feely, S. van Heuven, M. Hoppema, M. Ishii, R. M. Key, A.
  Kozyr, S. K. Lauvset, C. Lo Monaco, J. T. Mathis, A. Murata, A. Olsen, F. F. Perez, C. L. Sabine,
  T. Tanhua, and R. Wanninkhof. 2019. The oceanic sink for anthropogenic CO2 from 1994 to
  2007. Science 363:1193-1199.
- Hale, R., J. A. Godbold, M. Sciberras, J. Dwight, C. Wood, J. G. Hiddink, and M. Solan. 2017. Mediation
   of macronutrients and carbon by post-disturbance shelf sea sediment communities.
   Biogeochemistry 135:121-133.
- Halpern, B. S., M. Frazier, J. Afflerbach, J. S. Lowndes, F. Micheli, C. O'Hara, C. Scarborough, and K. A.
   Selkoe. 2019. Recent pace of change in human impact on the world's ocean. Scientific Reports
   9:11609.
- Hiddink, J. G., S. Jennings, M. Sciberras, C. L. Szostek, K. M. Hughes, N. Ellis, A. D. Rijnsdorp, R. A.
  McConnaughey, T. Mazor, R. Hilborn, J. S. Collie, C. R. Pitcher, R. O. Amoroso, A. M. Parma, P.
  Suuronen, and M. J. Kaiser. 2017. Global analysis of depletion and recovery of seabed biota
  after bottom trawling disturbance. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the
  USA 114:8301-8306.

- Hinz, H., V. Prieto, and M. J. Kaiser. 2009. Trawl disturbance on benthic communities: chronic effects
   and experimental predictions. Ecological Applications 19:761-773.
- Howard, J., A. Sutton-Grier, D. Herr, J. Kleypas, E. Landis, E. McLeod, E. Pidgeon, and S. Simpson. 2017.
   Clarifying the role of coastal and marine systems in climate mitigation. Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment 15:42-50.
- Hulthe, G., S. Hulth, and P. O. J. Hall. 1998. Effect of oxygen on degradation rate of refractory and labile
   organic matter in continental margin sediments. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 8:1319–
   1328.
- Jones, J. B. 1992. Environmental impact of trawling on the seabed: A review. New Zealand Journal of
   Marine and Freshwater Research 26:59-67.
- Kaiser, M. J., K. R. Clarke, H. Hinz, M. C. V. Austen, P. J. Somerfield, and I. Karakassis. 2006. Global
   analysis of response and recovery of benthic biota to fishing. Marine Ecology Progress Series
   311:1-14.
- Kaiser, M. J., J. S. Collie, S. J. Hall, S. Jennings, and I. R. Poiner. 2002. Modification of marine habitats
   by trawling activities prognosis and solutions. Fish and Fisheries 3:114-136.
- Keil, R. 2017. Anthropogenic Forcing of Carbonate and Organic Carbon Preservation in Marine
   Sediments. Annual Review of Marine Science **9**:151-172.
- 787 Khatiwala, S., F. Primeau, and T. Hall. 2009. Reconstruction of the history of anthropogenic CO2
   788 concentrations in the ocean. Nature 462:346-349.
- Krause-Jensen, D., and C. M. Duarte. 2016. Substantial role of macroalgae in marine carbon
   sequestration. Nature Geoscience 9:737-742.
- Kristensen, E., S. I. Ahmed, and A. H. Devol. 1995. Aerobic and anaerobic decomposition of organic
   matter in marine sediment: Which is fastest? Limnology and Oceanography 40:1430-1437.
- Kroodsma, D. A., J. Mayorga, T. Hochberg, N. A. Miller, K. Boerder, F. Ferretti, A. Wilson, B. Bergman,
  T. D. White, B. A. Block, P. Woods, B. Sullivan, C. Costello, and B. Worm. 2018. Tracking the
  global footprint of fisheries. Science 359:904-908.
- Lamarque, B., B. Deflandre, A. G. Dalto, S. Schmidt, A. Romero-Ramirez, F. Garabetian, N. Dubosq, M.
   Diaz, F. Grasso, A. Sottolichio, G. Bernard, H. Gillet, M. A. Cordier, D. Poirier, P. Lebleu, H.
   Derriennic, M. Danilo, M. M. B. Tenorio, and A. Gremare. 2021. Spatial Distributions of Surface
   Sedimentary Organics and Sediment Profile Image Characteristics in a High-Energy Temperate
   Marine RiOMar: The West Gironde Mud Patch. Journal of Marine Science and Engineering
   929.
- LaRowe, D. E., S. Arndt, J. A. Bradley, E. R. Estes, A. Hoarfrost, S. Q. Lang, K. G. Lloyd, N. Mahmoudi, W.
   D. Orsi, S. R. Shah Walter, A. D. Steen, and R. Zhao. 2020. The fate of organic carbon in marine
   sediments New insights from recent data and analysis. Earth-Science Reviews 204.
- Lee, T. R., W. T. Wood, and B. J. Phrampus. 2019. A Machine Learning (kNN) Approach to Predicting
   Global Seafloor Total Organic Carbon. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 33:37-46.
- Legge, O., M. Johnson, N. Hicks, T. Jickells, M. Diesing, J. Aldridge, J. Andrews, Y. Artioli, D. C. E. Bakker,
  M. T. Burrows, N. Carr, G. Cripps, S. L. Felgate, L. Fernand, N. Greenwood, S. Hartman, S.
  Kröger, G. Lessin, C. Mahaffey, D. J. Mayor, R. Parker, A. M. Queirós, J. D. Shutler, T. Silva, H.
  Stahl, J. Tinker, G. J. C. Underwood, J. Van Der Molen, S. Wakelin, K. Weston, and P.
  Williamson. 2020. Carbon on the Northwest European Shelf: Contemporary Budget and
  Future Influences. Frontiers in Marine Science **7**:Article 143.
- Lindeboom, H. J., and S. de Groot. 1998. The effects of different types of fisheries on the north sea and Irish sea benthic ecosystems. IMACT -II. NIOZ-RAPPORT 1998-1.
- Liu, X. S., W. Z. Xu, S. G. Cheung, and P. K. S. Shin. 2011. Response of meiofaunal community with
   special reference to nematodes upon deployment of artificial reefs and cessation of bottom
   trawling in subtropical waters, Hong Kong. Marine Pollution Bulletin 63:376-384.
- Lovelock, C. E., and C. M. Duarte. 2019. Dimensions of Blue Carbon and emerging perspectives. Biology
   Letters 15:20180781.

- Lovelock, C. E., J. W. Fourqurean, and J. T. Morris. 2017. Modeled CO2 Emissions from Coastal Wetland
   Transitions to Other Land Uses: Tidal Marshes, Mangrove Forests, and Seagrass Beds.
   Frontiers in Marine Science 4:143.
- Luisetti, T., R. K. Turner, J. E. Andrews, T. D. Jickells, S. Kröger, M. Diesing, L. Paltriguera, M. T. Johnson,
  E. R. Parker, D. C. E. Bakker, and K. Weston. 2019. Quantifying and valuing carbon flows and
  stores in coastal and shelf ecosystems in the UK. Ecosystem Services **35**:67-76.
- MacIntyre, H. L., R. J. Geider, and D. C. Miller. 1996. Microphytobenthos: The ecological role of the
   "secret garden" of unvegetated, shallow-water marine habitats. I. Distribution, abundance
   and primary production. Estuaries **19**:186-201.
- Mandal, A., A. Dutta, R. Das, and J. Mukherjee. 2021. Role of intertidal microbial communities in carbon dioxide sequestration and pollutant removal: A review. Marine Pollution Bulletin
   170:112626.
- Mariani, G., W. W. L. Cheung, A. Lyet, E. Sala, J. Mayorga, L. Velez, S. D. Gaines, T. Dejean, M.
   Troussellier, and D. Mouillot. 2020. Let more big fish sink: Fisheries prevent blue carbon
   sequestration—half in unprofitable areas. Science Advances 6:eabb4848.
- 835 Marine Conservation Institute. 2021. MPA Atlas. Acessed: March 11, 2021.
- Martín, J., A. Palanques, and P. Puig. 2006. Composition and variability of downward particulate
   matter fluxes in the Palamós submarine canyon (NW Mediterranean). Journal of Marine
   Systems 60:75-97.
- Martín, J., P. Puig, P. Masque, A. Palanques, and A. Sanchez-Gomez. 2014a. Impact of bottom trawling
   on deep-sea sediment properties along the flanks of a submarine canyon. PLoS One
   9:e104536.
- Martín, J., P. Puig, A. Palanques, and A. Giamportone. 2014b. Commercial bottom trawling as a driver
   of sediment dynamics and deep seascape evolution in the Anthropocene. Anthropocene 7:1 15.
- Martín, J., P. Puig, A. Palanques, P. Masqué, and J. García-Orellana. 2008. Effect of commercial trawling
  on the deep sedimentation in a Mediterranean submarine canyon. Marine Geology 252:150155.
- 848 Mayer, L. M., D. F. Schick, R. H. Findlay, and D. L. Rice. 1991. Effects of commercial dragging on 849 sedimentary organic matter. Marine Environmental Research **31**:249-261.
- McLaverty, C., O. R. Eigaard, G. E. Dinesen, H. Gislason, A. Kokkalis, A. C. Erichsen, and J. K. Petersen.
   2020. High-resolution fisheries data reveal effects of bivalve dredging on benthic communities
   in stressed coastal systems. Marine Ecology Progress Series 642:21-38.
- McLeod, E., G. L. Chmura, S. Bouillon, R. Salm, M. Björk, C. M. Duarte, C. E. Lovelock, W. H. Schlesinger,
  and B. R. Silliman. 2011. A blueprint for blue carbon: toward an improved understanding of
  the role of vegetated coastal habitats in sequestering CO2. Frontiers in Ecology and the
  Environment 9:552-560.
- Mengual, B., F. Cayocca, P. Le Hir, R. Draye, P. Laffargue, B. Vincent, and T. Garlan. 2016. Influence of
  bottom trawling on sediment resuspension in the 'Grande-Vasière' area (Bay of Biscay,
  France). Ocean Dynamics 66:1181-1207.
- Mercaldo-Allen, R., R. Goldberg, P. Clark, C. Kuropat, S. L. Meseck, and J. M. Rose. 2016. Benthic
   Ecology of Northern Quahog Beds with Different Hydraulic Dredging Histories in Long Island
   Sound. Journal of Coastal Research 32:408-415.
- Meseck, S. L., R. Mercaldo-Allen, J. M. Rose, P. Clark, C. Kuropat, J. J. Pereira, and R. Goldberg. 2014.
   Effects of hydraulic dredging for mercenaria mercenaria, Northern Quahog, on sediment
   biogeochemistry. Journal of the World Aquaculture Society 45:301-311.
- Middelburg, J. J. 2018. Reviews and syntheses: to the bottom of carbon processing at the seafloor.
   Biogeosciences 15:413-427.
- Miller, D. C., R. J. Geider, and H. L. MacIntyre. 1996. Microphytobenthos: The ecological role of the
   "secret garden" of unvegetated, shallow-water marine habitats. II. role in sediment stability
   and shallow-water food webs. Estuaries 19:202-212.

- 871 Morys, C., V. Brüchert, and C. Bradshaw. 2021. Impacts of bottom trawling on benthic 872 biogeochemistry: an experimental field study. Marine Environmental Research:105384.
- Nellemann, C., E. Corcoran, C. M. Duarte, L. Valdés, C. De Young, L. Fonseca, and G. Grimsditch. 2009.
   Blue Carbon: A Rapid Response Assessment. United Nations Environment Programme, GRID Arendal, Norway.
- 876 O'Hara, C. C., M. Frazier, and B. S. Halpern. 2021. At-risk marine biodiversity faces extensive, 877 expanding, and intensifying human impacts. Science **372**:84-87.
- O'Neill, F. G., and K. Summerbell. 2011. The mobilisation of sediment by demersal otter trawls. Marine
   Pollution Bulletin 62:1088-1097.
- Oberle, F. K. J., C. D. Storlazzi, and T. J. J. Hanebuth. 2016a. What a drag: Quantifying the global impact
   of chronic bottom trawling on continental shelf sediment. Journal of Marine Systems 159:109 119.
- Oberle, F. K. J., P. W. Swarzenski, C. M. Reddy, R. K. Nelson, B. Baasch, and T. J. J. Hanebuth. 2016b.
   Deciphering the lithological consequences of bottom trawling to sedimentary habitats on the
   shelf. Journal of Marine Systems 159:120-131.
- Ordines, F., M. Ramón, J. Rivera, C. Rodríguez-Prieto, M. T. Farriols, B. Guijarro, C. Pasqual, and E.
   Massutí. 2017. Why long term trawled red algae beds off Balearic Islands (western
   Mediterranean) still persist? Regional Studies in Marine Science 15:39-49.
- Palanques, A., J. Guillén, and P. Puig. 2001. Impact of bottom trawling on water turbidity and muddy
   sediment of an unfished continental shelf. Limnology and Oceanography 46:1100-1110.
- Palanques, A., J. Martín, P. Puig, J. Guillén, J. B. Company, and F. Sardà. 2006. Evidence of sediment
   gravity flows induced by trawling in the Palamós (Fonera) submarine canyon (northwestern
   Mediterranean). Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 53:201-214.
- Palanques, A., P. Puig, J. Guillén, M. Demestre, and J. Martín. 2014. Effects of bottom trawling on the
   Ebro continental shelf sedimentary system (NW Mediterranean). Continental Shelf Research
   72:83-98.
- Paradis, S., M. Goñi, P. Masqué, R. Durán, M. Arjona-Camas, A. Palanques, and P. Puig. 2021.
   Persistence of Biogeochemical Alterations of Deep-Sea Sediments by Bottom Trawling.
   Geophysical Research Letters 48:e2020GL091279.
- Paradis, S., P. Puig, A. Sanchez-Vidal, P. Masqué, J. Garcia-Orellana, A. Calafat, and M. Canals. 2018.
   Spatial distribution of sedimentation-rate increases in Blanes Canyon caused by technification
   of bottom trawling fleet. Progress in Oceanography 169:241-252.
- Paradis, S., A. Pusceddu, P. Masqué, P. Puig, D. Moccia, T. Russo, and C. Lo Iacono. 2019. Organic
   matter contents and degradation in a highly trawled area during fresh particle inputs (Gulf of
   Castellammare, southwestern Mediterranean). Biogeosciences 16:4307-4320.
- Parker, R. W. R., J. L. Blanchard, C. Gardner, B. S. Green, K. Hartmann, P. H. Tyedmers, and R. A.
  Watson. 2018. Fuel use and greenhouse gas emissions of world fisheries. Nature Climate
  Change 8:333-337.
- Pendleton, L., D. C. Donato, B. C. Murray, S. Crooks, W. A. Jenkins, S. Sifleet, C. Craft, J. W. Fourqurean,
  J. B. Kauffman, N. Marbà, P. Megonigal, E. Pidgeon, D. Herr, D. Gordon, and A. Baldera. 2012.
  Estimating Global "Blue Carbon" Emissions from Conversion and Degradation of Vegetated
  Coastal Ecosystems. PLoS One **7**:e43542.
- Pershing, A. J., L. B. Christensen, N. R. Record, G. D. Sherwood, and P. B. Stetson. 2010. The Impact of
   Whaling on the Ocean Carbon Cycle: Why Bigger Was Better. PLoS One 5:e12444.
- Pinnegar, J. K., and G. H. Engelhard. 2008. The 'shifting baseline'phenomenon: a global perspective.
   Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries **18**:1-16.
- Polymenakou, P. N., A. Pusceddu, A. Tselepides, T. Polychronaki, A. Giannakourou, C. Fiordelmondo,
   E. Hatziyanni, and R. Danovaro. 2005. Benthic microbial abundance and activities in an
   intensively trawled ecosystem (Thermaikos Gulf, Aegean Sea). Continental Shelf Research
   25:2570-2584.

- Puig, P., M. Canals, J. B. Company, J. Martin, D. Amblas, G. Lastras, and A. Palanques. 2012. Ploughing
   the deep sea floor. Nature 489:286-289.
- Pusceddu, A., S. Bianchelli, and R. Danovaro. 2015. Quantity and biochemical composition of
   particulate organic matter in a highly trawled area (Thermaikos Gulf, Eastern Mediterranean
   Sea). Advances in Oceanography and Limnology 6:21-34.
- Pusceddu, A., S. Bianchelli, J. Martin, P. Puig, A. Palanques, P. Masque, and R. Danovaro. 2014. Chronic
   and intensive bottom trawling impairs deep-sea biodiversity and ecosystem functioning.
   Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA 111:8861-8866.
- Pusceddu, A., C. Fiordelmondo, P. Polymenakou, T. Polychronaki, A. Tselepides, and R. Danovaro.
   2005a. Effects of bottom trawling on the quantity and biochemical composition of organic
   matter in coastal marine sediments (Thermaikos Gulf, northwestern Aegean Sea). Continental
   Shelf Research 25:2491-2505.
- Pusceddu, A., A. Grémare, K. Escoubeyrou, J. M. Amouroux, C. Fiordelmondo, and R. Danovaro. 2005b.
   Impact of natural (storm) and anthropogenic (trawling) sediment resuspension on particulate
   organic matter in coastal environments. Continental Shelf Research 25:2506-2520.
- Queirós, A. M., J. G. Hiddink, M. J. Kaiser, and H. Hinz. 2006. Effects of chronic bottom trawling
   disturbance on benthic biomass, production and size spectra in different habitats. Journal of
   Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 335:91-103.
- Rajesh, N., S. Muthuvelu, G. Mahadevan, and P. Murugesan. 2019. Impact of bottom trawling on water
   and sediment characteristics of Cuddalore and Parangipettai coastal waters. Indian Journal of
   Geo-Marine Sciences 48:639-646.
- Ramalho, S. P., M. Almeida, P. Esquete, L. Génio, A. Ravara, C. F. Rodrigues, N. Lampadariou, A.
  Vanreusel, and M. R. Cunha. 2018. Bottom-trawling fisheries influence on standing stocks,
  composition, diversity and trophic redundancy of macrofaunal assemblages from the West
  Iberian Margin. Deep-Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 138:131-145.
- 946 Ramalho, S. P., L. Lins, K. Soetaert, N. Lampadariou, M. R. Cunha, A. Vanreusel, and E. Pape. 2020.
  947 Ecosystem Functioning Under the Influence of Bottom-Trawling Disturbance: An Experimental
  948 Approach and Field Observations From a Continental Slope Area in the West Iberian Margin.
  949 Frontiers in Marine Science **7**:457.
- Riekenberg, P. M., J. M. Oakes, and B. D. Eyre. 2020. Shining Light on Priming in Euphotic Sediments:
   Nutrient Enrichment Stimulates Export of Stored Organic Matter. Environmental Science &
   Technology 54:11165-11172.
- Rijnsdorp, A. D., J. G. Hiddink, P. D. van Denderen, N. T. Hintzen, O. R. Eigaard, S. Valanko, F. Bastardie,
  S. G. Bolam, P. Boulcott, J. Egekvist, C. Garcia, G. van Hoey, P. Jonsson, P. Laffargue, J. R.
  Nielsen, G. J. Piet, M. Sköld, and T. van Kooten. 2020. Different bottom trawl fisheries have a
  differential impact on the status of the North Sea seafloor habitats. ICES Journal of Marine
  Science **77**:1772-1786.
- 958 Roberts, C. 2007. The unnatural history of the sea. Island Press, UK.
- Roberts, C. M., B. C. O'Leary, and J. P. Hawkins. 2020. Climate change mitigation and nature
   conservation both require higher protected area targets. Philosophical Transactions of the
   Royal Society B: Biological Sciences **375**:20190121.
- Roberts, C. M., B. C. O'Leary, D. J. McCauley, P. M. Cury, C. M. Duarte, J. Lubchenco, D. Pauly, A. Saenz Arroyo, U. R. Sumaila, R. W. Wilson, B. Worm, and J. C. Castilla. 2017. Marine reserves can
   mitigate and promote adaptation to climate change. Proceedings of the National Academy of
   Sciences of the USA **114**:6167-6175.
- Rosli, N., D. Leduc, A. A. Rowden, M. R. Clark, P. K. Probert, K. Berkenbusch, and C. Neira. 2016.
  Differences in meiofauna communities with sediment depth are greater than habitat effects
  on the New Zealand continental margin: implications for vulnerability to anthropogenic
  disturbance. Peerj 4:39.
- Ruffin, K. K. 1998. The Persistence of Anthropogenic Turbidity Plumes in a Shallow Water Estuary.
   Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science 47:579-592.

- Rühl, S., C. Thompson, A. M. Queirós, and S. Widdicombe. 2020. Missing links in the study of solute
   and particle exchange between the sea floor and water column. ICES Journal of Marine
   Science 77:1602-1616.
- Saba, G. K., A. B. Burd, J. P. Dunne, S. Hernández-León, A. H. Martin, K. A. Rose, J. Salisbury, D. K.
  Steinberg, C. N. Trueman, R. W. Wilson, and S. E. Wilson. 2021. Toward a better understanding
  of fish-based contribution to ocean carbon flux. Limnology and Oceanography:in press.
- Sala, E., J. Mayorga, D. Bradley, R. B. Cabral, T. B. Atwood, A. Auber, W. Cheung, C. Costello, F. Ferretti,
  A. M. Friedlander, S. D. Gaines, C. Garilao, W. Goodell, B. S. Halpern, A. Hinson, K. Kaschner,
  K. Kesner-Reyes, F. Leprieur, J. McGowan, L. E. Morgan, D. Mouillot, J. Palacios-Abrantes, H.
  P. Possingham, K. D. Rechberger, B. Worm, and J. Lubchenco. 2021. Protecting the global
- 982 ocean for biodiversity, food and climate. Nature **592**:397-402.
- Schratzberger, M., N. Lampadariou, P. J. Somerfield, L. Vandepitte, and E. Vanden Berghe. 2009. The
   impact of seabed disturbance on nematode communities: linking field and laboratory
   observations. Marine Biology 156:709-724.
- Sciberras, M., J. G. Hiddink, S. Jennings, C. L. Szostek, K. M. Hughes, B. Kneafsey, L. J. Clarke, N. Ellis, A.
  D. Rijnsdorp, R. A. McConnaughey, R. Hilborn, J. S. Collie, C. R. Pitcher, R. O. Amoroso, A. M.
  Parma, P. Suuronen, and M. J. Kaiser. 2018. Response of benthic fauna to experimental
  bottom fishing: A global meta-analysis. Fish and Fisheries **19**:698-715.
- Sciberras, M., R. Parker, C. Powell, C. Robertson, S. Kröger, S. Bolam, and J. Geert Hiddink. 2016.
   Impacts of bottom fishing on the sediment infaunal community and biogeochemistry of
   cohesive and non-cohesive sediments. Limnology and Oceanography 61:2076-2089.
- Seddon, N., B. Turner, P. Berry, A. Chausson, and C. A. J. Girardin. 2019. Grounding nature-based
   climate solutions in sound biodiversity science. Nature Climate Change 9:84-87.
- Seiter, K., C. Hensen, J. Schröter, and M. Zabel. 2004. Organic carbon content in surface sediments—
   defining regional provinces. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers
   51:2001-2026.
- Serpetti, N., E. Gontikaki, B. E. Narayanaswamy, and U. Witte. 2013. Macrofaunal community inside
   and outside of the Darwin Mounds Special Area of Conservation, NE Atlantic. Biogeosciences
   1000
   10:3705-3714.
- Sgro, L., M. Mistri, and J. Widdows. 2005. Impact of the infaunal Manila clam, *Ruditapes philippinarum*,
   on sediment stability. Hydrobiologia 550:175-182.
- Sheridan, P., and J. Doerr. 2005. Short-term effects of the cessation of shrimp trawling on Texas
   benthic habitats. Pages 571-578 *in* B. W. Barnes and J. P. Thomas, editors. Benthic Habitats
   and the Effects of Fishing. Amer Fisheries Soc, Bethesda.
- Smeaton, C., C. A. Hunt, W. R. Turrell, and W. E. N. Austin. 2021. Marine Sedimentary Carbon Stocks
   of the United Kingdom's Exclusive Economic Zone. Frontiers in Earth Science 9:50.
- 1008Smith, C. 2000. Impact of otter trawling on an eastern Mediterranean commercial trawl fishing1009ground. ICES Journal of Marine Science 57:1340-1351.
- Smith, J. D., and S. R. McLean. 1977. Boundary Layer Adjustments to Bottom Topography and
   Suspended Sediment. Pages 123-151 *in* J. C. J. Nihoul, editor. Elsevier Oceanography Series.
   Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Snelgrove, P. V. R., K. Soetaert, M. Solan, S. Thrush, C. L. Wei, R. Danovaro, R. W. Fulweiler, H. Kitazato,
   B. Ingole, A. Norkko, R. J. Parkes, and N. Volkenborn. 2018. Global Carbon Cycling on a
   Heterogeneous Seafloor. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 33:96-105.
- Soulsby, R. 1997. Dynamics of marine sands: A manual for practical applications. Thomas Telford,
   Telford, London.
- Thrush, S. F., and P. K. Dayton. 2002. Disturbance to Marine Benthic Habitats by Trawling and
   Dredging: Implications for Marine Biodiversity. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics
   33:449-473.
- 1021Tiano, J. C., K. J. van der Reijden, S. O'Flynn, O. Beauchard, S. van der Ree, J. van der Wees, T. Ysebaert,1022and K. Soetaert. 2020. Experimental bottom trawling finds resilience in large-bodied infauna

1023but vulnerability for epifauna and juveniles in the Frisian Front. Marine Environmental1024Research 159:104964.

- 1025Tiano, J. C., R. Witbaard, M. J. N. Bergman, P. van Rijswijk, A. Tramper, D. van Oevelen, K. Soetaert,1026and S. Degraer. 2019. Acute impacts of bottom trawl gears on benthic metabolism and1027nutrient cycling. ICES Journal of Marine Science **76**:1917-1930.
- Tillin, H. M., J. G. Hiddink, S. Jennings, and M. J. Kaiser. 2006. Chronic bottom trawling alters the
   functional composition of benthic invertebrate communities on a sea-basin scale. Marine
   Ecology Progress Series **318**:31-45.
- Trimmer, M., J. Petersen, S. D. B., C. Mills, E. Young, and E. R. Parker. 2005. Impact of long-term benthic
   trawl disturbance on sediment sorting and biogeochemistry in the southern North Sea. Marine
   Ecology Progress Series 298:79-94.
- 1034Trueman, C. N., G. Johnston, B. O'Hea, and K. M. MacKenzie. 2014. Trophic interactions of fish1035communities at midwater depths enhance long-term carbon storage and benthic production1036on continental slopes. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences **281**:20140669.
- 1037Turner, J. T. 2015. Zooplankton fecal pellets, marine snow, phytodetritus and the ocean's biological1038pump. Progress in Oceanography 130:205-248.
- van de Velde, S., V. Van Lancker, S. Hidalgo-Martinez, W. M. Berelson, and F. J. R. Meysman. 2018.
   Anthropogenic disturbance keeps the coastal seafloor biogeochemistry in a transient state.
   Scientific Reports 8:5582.
- van der Molen, J., J. N. Aldridge, C. Coughlan, E. R. Parker, D. Stephens, and P. Ruardij. 2012. Modelling
   marine ecosystem response to climate change and trawling in the North Sea. Biogeochemistry
   113:213-236.
- van Nugteren, P., L. Moodley, G.-J. Brummer, C. H. R. Heip, P. M. J. Herman, and J. J. Middelburg. 2009.
   Seafloor ecosystem functioning: the importance of organic matter priming. Marine Biology
   1047 156:2277-2287.
- Wainright, S. C., and C. S. Hopkinson Jr. 1997. Effects of sediment resuspension on organic matter
   processing in coastal environments: A simulation model. Journal of Marine Systems 11:353 368.
- 1051 Wang, Z., K. M. Y. Leung, Y. H. Sung, D. Dudgeon, and J. W. Qiu. 2021. Recovery of tropical marine
   1052 benthos after a trawl ban demonstrates linkage between abiotic and biotic changes.
   1053 Communications Biology 4:212.
- Watling, L., R. H. Findlay, L. M. Mayer, and D. F. Schick. 2001. Impact of a scallop drag on the sediment
   chemistry, microbiota, and faunal assemblages of a shallow subtidal marine benthic
   community. Journal of Sea Research 46:309-324.
- 1057 Watson, A. J., U. Schuster, J. D. Shutler, T. Holding, I. G. C. Ashton, P. Landschutzer, D. K. Woolf, and L.
   1058 Goddijn-Murphy. 2020. Revised estimates of ocean-atmosphere CO2 flux are consistent with
   1059 ocean carbon inventory. Nature Communications 11:4422.
- Watson, R. A., and T. Morato. 2013. Fishing down the deep: Accounting for within-species changes in
   depth of fishing. Fisheries Research 140:63-65.
- Wilkinson, G. M., A. Besterman, C. Buelo, J. Gephart, and M. L. Pace. 2018. A synthesis of modern
   organic carbon accumulation rates in coastal and aquatic inland ecosystems. Scientific Reports
   8:15736.
- 1065 Winterwerp, J. C., and C. Kranenburg. 2002. Fine sediment dynamics in the marine environment.1066 Elsevier.
- Yallop, M. L., B. de Winder, D. M. Paterson, and L. J. Stal. 1994. Comparative structure, primary
   production and biogenic stabilization of cohesive and non-cohesive marine sediments
   inhabited by microphytobenthos. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science 39:565-582.
- 1070
- 1071
- 1072
- 1073

- **Author contributions**: GE prepared the original draft and undertook the systematic review.
- 1075 All authors contributed to conceptualisation, writing, reviewing and editing.
- **Funding**: This work was funded by BLUE Marine Foundation through the Barclays Ocean
- 1078 Climate Impact grant.
- **Conflicts of interest:** The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.